

this House would approve of what was absolutely necessary. A large revenue was being received from these two goldfields, and what would the people out there say?—that the Government were grabbing all the revenue, and doing nothing in return for the people on the fields. They would also say the Government and Parliament had no faith in these goldfields, unless permanent buildings were erected there. He believed the Government were acting wisely in showing their faith in the permanency of these goldfields, by erecting public buildings at once. They might be erected at perhaps a third cheaper cost, by waiting until the railways were completed; but, after full consideration the Government had decided to go on with these works.

MR. R. F. SHOLL said he did not believe there was any necessity for these expensive buildings at present, and they could well wait until the railways were made.

Vote put and passed.

The Additional Estimates being completed, the resolutions of the committee were reported.

ADJOURNMENT.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) moved that the House, at its rising, do adjourn until Tuesday evening, 6th November, at half-past seven o'clock p.m.

Question put and passed.

The House adjourned at 12.12 o'clock midnight.

Legislative Assembly.

Tuesday, 6th November, 1894.

Annual Departmental Report of the Railway Department—Repeal of Stock Tax—Suspension of Thomas Britnall, as assistant foreman, Perth Goods Shed—Loan Estimates, 1894-5, introduced and agreed to—Police Act Amendment Bill: Reasons for disagreeing with Council's amendments—Pharmacy and Poisons Bill: consideration of the Committee's Report—Estimates, 1894-5: Committee's Report—Appropriation Bill, 1894-5: first reading—Adjournment.

THE SPEAKER took the chair at 7.30 p.m.

PRAYERS.

ANNUAL REPORT OF THE RAILWAY DEPARTMENT.

MR. LEAKE, in accordance with notice, asked the Commissioner of Railways if it were the intention of the Government to follow the practice with regard to other departments, and present a report upon the Railway Department to this or any future Parliament?

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn) replied that the report would be presented to Parliament at an early date.

REPEAL OF STOCK TAX.

MR. MONGER (on behalf of Mr. James), in accordance with notice, asked the Premier whether the Government would, during this or next session, introduce legislation to repeal the stock tax?

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) replied that the Government had no intention of doing so at present.

SUSPENSION OF ASSISTANT FOREMAN, PERTH GOODS SHED.

MR. MONGER (on behalf of Mr. James), in accordance with notice, asked the Commissioner of Railways,—(1.) Why Thomas Britnall was suspended from work as assistant foreman of the Perth Goods Shed? (2.) Would the Commissioner look most carefully into the matter, and make full inquiry before dismissing the man?

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn) replied as follows: (1.) Suspended for disobeying orders, viz., refusing to return to work

after the ordinary goods shed hours.
(2.) Certainly.

MR. R. F. SHOLL: I should like to ask, without notice, whether the Government feel they are at liberty to dispense with the services of any servant without first consulting some member of this House?

MR. WOOD: Is the Commissioner aware, of his own knowledge, whether it is a fact that this man, Britnall, was working $10\frac{1}{2}$ and 11 hours a day for several days before he was suspended, and that on the occasion when he declined to return to work he was very unwell, and could not go back to the sheds? That is the reason I have heard assigned for his not returning to work when ordered to do so, and I think, myself, the man was treated in a most harsh manner.

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn): I am not in possession of any details to enable me to reply to the hon. member's statement, but I understand this was not the first occasion that this man refused to go to work after hours. Members will readily understand that such conduct may give rise to great inconvenience, because it is necessary for railway servants to work whenever the work is pressing. Members of the Government have often to work day and night, and it is perfectly absurd for a railway servant to say he will not return to work after office hours when the head of his department tells him to return. I am not in possession of the exact facts connected with this case, but I shall look carefully into the matter, and if there are any extenuating circumstances they will be considered.

LOAN ESTIMATES, 1894-95.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest), in accordance with notice, moved that the House do now resolve itself into a committee of the whole to consider the Estimates of Expenditure from Loan Funds for the twelve months ending 30th June, 1895.

Question put and passed.

THE SPEAKER left the chair.

IN COMMITTEE.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) introduced the Loan Estimates, 1894-5. He said: Mr. Traylen.—In rising to

move the consideration of these Estimates, I do not think it will be necessary for me to say very much, because the Estimates themselves, in the form in which they are now placed before members, explain, to a very large extent, what is proposed to be done. It will be noticed from the general summary, on page 3, that it is proposed to expend out of loan funds during the twelve months ending 30th June, 1895, the large amount of £987,037 5s. 1d. With regard to the Loan of 1884 and the Loan of 1888, the expenditure from those loans has almost ceased. The unexpended balances remaining from these two loans only amount to £1,789 out of the Loan of 1884, and £1,340 out of the Loan of 1888; and it is intended that these two sums shall be spent during the coming year, and those loans will then be got rid of. With regard to the Loan of 1891, although there is a balance of £223,947, nearly the whole of that sum has already been pledged. Members on reference to pp. 24 to 26 of these Estimates, will find exactly how that Loan stands. The works to be completed out of it include the completion of the railway from Boyanup to Minninup Bridge, and the extension from Boyanup to Busselton, both of which works, it is anticipated, will be shortly completed. Then there is the Yilgarn Railway. That also is almost completed, and it is expected to be out of hand within the next few months. The railway from Geraldton to Mullewa is also nearing completion, and all that is remaining out of the vote now is £8,966. I do not think I need go through all the other items included in that Loan, except one or two of the most important items. With regard to the harbour works at Fremantle, it is proposed during the year to complete the North mole, also to make some progress with the South mole, and to proceed with the necessary excavation of rock at the bar, and to do some dredging in the river basin. It is estimated that the expenditure on these works will amount to about £45,000. If members will look at pp. 25 and 26 they will see exactly what the position is of the other works included in this Loan of 1891, and the progress and expenditure anticipated during the coming twelve months. The same information is also furnished with regard to the Loan of

1893. Those two loans are by this time somewhat ancient history. The amounts have all been allocated and the works approved by this House, and it only remains for the Government to carry out the works as quickly as they can. In regard to the new Loan of £1,500,000, which has been approved of this session, it will be noticed that the Government propose to spend £544,200 out of that sum during the coming year; and that expenditure is probably of more interest and importance to members than any other part of these Estimates, because it deals with new undertakings, all of which, however, have been approved of by this House. With regard to the first item, the railway from Mullewa to the Murchison goldfields, members will notice that out of the £409,000 voted for that work, it is proposed during the next twelve months to expend £86,000. The progress anticipated to be made during that period is the letting of the contract for all rails and fastenings, also for sufficient sleepers to enable the work to be started without delay. It has been found that a good deal of delay has occurred in connection with previous contracts, owing to the contractors not having the sleepers ready to enable them to proceed with the work at once, and we propose to obviate that delay, in this instance, by obtaining sufficient sleepers to enable the work to be started as soon as the contract is let, or, at any rate, sooner than if the contractor had to look about him and get the sleepers himself. Some difficulty and delay have been experienced in the past from this cause, and we desire to overcome the difficulty in this instance in this way; so that, when this House meets again, not only will the survey of this Murchison railway be completed and the contract let, but we also hope that the work of construction will be well advanced. With regard to the railway from Southern Cross to Coolgardie, the same course is proposed to be adopted in connection with that work. It is estimated that, out of £228,000 voted for the work, a sum of £75,000 will be expended during the coming year. With regard to the railway from Donnybrook towards Bridgetown, it is intended to complete the survey of that line, and to prepare the plans for the contract, also to indent for rails and

fastenings. We do not intend, under these Estimates, to do anything in the way of construction, during the year ending 30th June, 1895, in connection with this line. With regard to the railway to the Collie coalfields, we only propose to spend £600 during the coming year, for surveys only. We do not intend to do anything more, thus carrying out the pledge we gave this House. With reference to the next item—rolling stock for these new railways, and additional rolling stock for existing lines, it is proposed to expend £60,650 out of the £174,000 voted for this purpose. This will be expended in the purchase of a considerable quantity of additional rolling stock to be used, so far as requisite, on the existing railways, pending its being required for the new extensions. I have already told members, and I think they will realise the advisability of it, that we intend, in future, to keep the vote for rolling stock altogether separate from the construction vote, and to consider the rolling stock as available for the whole of the railways of the colony, as it may be required. We have found in the past that it is really impossible to keep the rolling stock earmarked (as it were) for each separate railway, and to confine its use to that particular railway. Rolling stock, for instance, ordered for the South-Western line may perhaps be found to-day on the Yilgarn line, and, by-and-by, it may be in use on the Mullewa line. It is impossible to keep the rolling stock separate for each particular line, and we therefore propose to have it available for such lines as it may be requisite, and to shift it about as occasion may require. If it is slack time on the South-Western line, and it is busy time on the Eastern line, the rolling stock can be utilised on the line where it is most required. It is misleading, I think, to endeavour to keep all your rolling stock earmarked for each particular line of railway; and we have given up the idea on these Estimates, and we propose in future to have a general vote for rolling stock, separate from the construction vote required for each particular line. It will be very much more convenient, and we shall know exactly what we are spending on this important item. It is a growing item, too; in fact, there is scarcely any limit, in a progressive country, to the requirements of railways,

in regard to rolling stock. The amount required is something enormous—so much so that I feel sure even the large sum provided on these Estimates, and in this Loan Bill, for this purpose, will be found insufficient, and that in a very short time we shall have to come to this House and ask for more money for rolling stock. Looking at the way the colony is progressing at present—and we all hope it will continue to do so—I feel satisfied we shall have to further increase our rolling stock very considerably indeed. With regard to the next item, “Additional improvements to opened railways,” members will see, on page 33, a long list of the improvements proposed to be carried out during the next twelve months. It is unnecessary for me to enumerate them. Of course, some members may say that all or most of these items should be paid for out of railway revenue; but I join issue at once with regard to that statement. I do not think it will hold water for a moment. If it is put forward, it can be successfully combated. It simply comes to this: if we were to make and equip our railways, from the start, as complete as they ought to be to meet our requirements for all time, it would necessitate an immense amount of expenditure—a good deal of it unnecessary—at the beginning; whereas all we can be justly expected to do, at first, is to make our railways as cheaply as we possibly can, by providing only such facilities as are absolutely necessary, and, as time goes on and the public requirements increase, provide those increased facilities as they are needed. It appears to me just as fair and reasonable that these increased facilities to meet the growing requirements of the country should be provided out of loan funds, as the facilities afforded in the first instance should be provided out of loan. Therefore, I cannot agree at all that if we want a new station building or an additional siding on a line of railway, owing to the increasing requirements of the country, these stations or sidings should be provided for out of the Consolidated Revenue, because they were not originally constructed when the line was built, simply because there was then no necessity for them. My own opinion is that these additional facilities, which are part and parcel of the same undertaking, should come out of loan funds, the same as if they

had been provided in the first instance. I think it is beyond the power of any one to argue successfully to the contrary. It is simply a question of whether, when we build our railways, we should build them so as to meet our requirements ten or twenty years hence, or simply build them to meet our immediate requirements, and, as time goes on and the traffic increases, and the wants of the public increase, provide the additional facilities necessary to meet these growing requirements. We are simply doing now what we would have had to do in the first instance, if the necessities of the service required it. With regard to the next item—harbour works, Fremantle, it is proposed to expend £55,400 within the next twelve months out of the £200,000 provided for these works on the new Loan Bill. This is supplementary to the allocation made for this purpose in the Loan of 1891. Members will see from the correspondence I laid on the table last night, between the Engineer-in-Chief and myself, that the Engineer-in-Chief is of opinion that these works when completed will provide a safe and commodious harbour for the ocean-going mail steamers, at all times and in all weathers. That is an important statement, which I wished to have on record. I am myself quite willing to bow to the opinion of the Engineer-in-Chief with regard to it, but I wished to have that opinion unmistakeably on record, so that everyone might see for himself what the intention and the opinion of the Engineer-in-Chief is with regard to that point. I felt, on reading the various reports made on the subject, that the Engineer-in-Chief had not, to my mind, expressed himself sufficiently clear on that point, though I have no doubt if Mr. O'Connor himself were here he would be able to show that he had. But I wished to give members the benefit of his deliberate opinion with regard to this matter, which opinion we now have, in the paper that I laid on the table last night,—that this harbour, when completed, will provide at Fremantle a safe and commodious harbour for the large mail steamers, at all times and in all weathers. I am perfectly satisfied, myself, with that opinion, because it comes from a man who knows the value of words deliberately used; and I think we may all rest satisfied with the

Engineer-in-Chief's opinion on that point, that the harbour we are now constructing at Fremantle will, when completed, provide a safe and commodious harbour for the ocean mail steamers at all times and in all weathers. That is exactly what we want, and, for my part, I would not be satisfied with anything less than that, and, if the harbour to be constructed did not provide that accommodation, then we must have some addition to it that will do so. However, the report of the Engineer-in-Chief, laid on the table last night, has altogether satisfied me with regard to the matter. He gives us his definite opinion on the subject, and I see no reason to dispute that opinion. The next item on these Estimates is that for the "Development of the goldfields and mineral resources." Out of that vote we propose, during the year, to erect public buildings at Marble Bar, and other places, and to provide for water supply at Coolgardie, Murchison, and other goldfields, supplementary to the votes for this purpose on previous Loan Acts. With regard to the item for the "Development of agriculture," etc., we propose to make a commencement with the construction of a market and cold storage at Perth, and other small matters. With reference to the next item, — harbour works at Geraldton—it is intended to let the contract for the extension of the jetty at that port, and to make a commencement with the work. This is an important work, and one that is very much required, and I have no doubt it will be put in hand almost immediately. From the general vote for the improvement of harbours and rivers, it is proposed to expend £25,000 during the coming year. This will include further dredging at Albany, so far as it is proposed to continue this work at present; also further extensions to jetties at the Vasse and Bunbury, improvement in shipping facilities at Carnarvon; the construction of a jetty and bonded store at Esperance Bay, and a jetty at Broome.

MR. RICHARDSON: What about a jetty at Carnarvon?

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest): We have not yet decided what is best to be done at Carnarvon. The question is a serious one, and I am afraid it will cost a lot of money to do what the residents require—something like £15,000.

MR. RICHARDSON: What about the recommendation of the select committee on the question of meat supply?

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest): I have read their report, but I do not know that we can act very much upon it until we have further information, and have another survey made.

MR. RICHARDSON: Will the Government be prepared to act upon the committee's recommendation, if the information justifies it?

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest): I really could not tell the hon. member, at present, whether we would or not. We have communicated with the Works Department about it, and suggested that another experienced officer should be sent up to examine the place, if the Engineer-in-Chief thinks it necessary. The local authorities seem to know all about the matter, but I very much question whether they really do. We have to decide whether we shall deepen and improve what is called Tagg's Channel and renew the present jetty, or build a new jetty from Babbage Island, and connect it with the town by a tramway. I understand this latter work would cost about £20,000, or possibly £25,000. I do not know whether members would be prepared to agree to that expenditure. However, we will do what we can in the matter. It is not so easy and cheap a job as some people imagine; it is a big business, and the question of what is best to be done will have to be considered very carefully before we actually decide what to do. The next item is that of "Lighthouses," for which there is £25,000 on the Loan Bill, and it is proposed to expend £10,850 out of it this next year. We intend building a lighthouse at Rottnest, and the contract for the stonework has already been let, and the lighthouse itself has been indented for. It will be of the most approved type, one of the best in the world, and will cost some £6,000 for the lighting apparatus alone. When complete, we shall be able to boast that we have a light second to none in the world.

AN HON. MEMBER: How far will it be visible?

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest): It will be visible at 25 miles, and will be a very splendid light. We have also indented for a new light for Carnarvon—

a really good light, visible, I think, about 14 miles, which is quite sufficient for that anchorage. We also propose to construct a light at Ouslow and at Broome, and at the North-West Cape, though I am not at present prepared to state the exact position of the light on that promontory. We also hope to improve the entrance to King George's Sound, probably by the erection of a lighthouse at Eclipse Island. The next item is the "Construction and extension of telegraph lines." Members will see the proposed works enumerated on the Estimates, and we intend to carry them out as quickly as we can. In future we intend on all possible occasions to have our telegraphs constructed departmentally, except in exceptional cases. We shall not then have to contend with the vexatious delays we have experienced in connection with some of these works in the past—as, for instance, the telegraph line to Cue. I sympathise with the people up there in their vexation at the delay that has taken place in the completion of that line, and, in future, we intend to keep these undertakings in our own hands, and carry them out ourselves. It may be a little more expensive, perhaps, but we can proceed then as quickly as we like, or slowly, whichever is best in the interests of the community. We propose to spend £10,850 of the vote for this purpose during the coming year. With regard to "Roads and bridges," out of the £50,000 allotted for these works, it is intended to expend £31,600, which includes the usual grants to the roads boards for new construction works, and also the commencement of works in connection with the proposed stock route. I have now gone through the various works which it is intended to carry out during the coming year out of loan funds. I believe they are all works that are very much required by the people of the colony, and that when completed they will be of great assistance in the development of the country, and productive of very great good indeed. I do not know that I need say very much more. All these items were thoroughly threshed out when the Loan Bill was under discussion. The Government thoroughly understand how it is intended that this money should be applied; and these Estimates are placed before members with the view of their approving of the expenditure pro-

posed during the coming year. They have already approved of the objects to which these loan moneys are to be applied, and these Estimates are submitted to members in order that they may see exactly what is proposed to be done during the year. They also are submitted in order that members may have an opportunity of seeing exactly what salaries it is intended to pay the various officers employed in connection with these loan undertakings. Both myself and my friend the Director of Public Works will be very glad to give any information we may possess with regard to these Estimates. Of course I fully recognise that a great deal of responsibility must rest with the Executive Government in connection with the carrying out of these works, as to whether they are carried out economically or whether there is extravagance. It is, of course, impossible for this House to look into every detail in connection with this large expenditure, and, whatever Government may be in power, they must be trusted to exercise economy and care in the expenditure of the funds committed to them. I can only say that, so far as we are concerned, our desire is to try to get the work done as economically as possible; and I believe that, in the past—although, as I have said on former occasions, there may be some few cases where money has not been expended as wisely as one could desire—still I think that on the whole we have been fairly successful. Although I have heard in some quarters that there has been more money spent on some works than was necessary, still I think everyone is willing to admit that the work done has been well done. I believe myself there is economy in doing things well. For my own part, I seldom see any extravagance shown in this direction, as I travel about the country. If any extravagance is brought under my notice, I bring it under the notice of the department concerned. I have much pleasure in moving the first item of these Loan Estimates,—“Salaries and Allowances, £44,083.”

MR. A. FORREST said there were one or two points in the Premier's statement which he would like to draw attention to. The Premier stated there had been some difficulty and delay in the past owing to contractors not being able

to get the sleepers they wanted for railway contracts. He altogether differed from the Premier on that point. There might be some delay perhaps if the contractor happened to possess a timber mill of his own, and therefore did not care to go anywhere else for his sleepers; but he did not think that any contractor, who did not depend entirely upon his own mill for his supplies, need experience the slightest difficulty in carrying out any contract. There were a great many timber mills now, and the trouble with them was to get any contracts at all. He did not think it would be better for the Government themselves to provide sleepers for contractors, and make the contractor buy his sleepers from them; it would be better to allow the contractor to get his sleepers in the lowest market. There would be a saving to the country in his doing so, as it would affect the price of the contract. As to the construction of telegraphs, he was glad to hear that the Government intended to do the work themselves in future. Perhaps it might not be done so cheaply, but it would be done far better and much quicker. They had an illustration of that in connection with the Coolgardie line, as compared with the delay that had occurred in the construction of the telegraph to Cue. He was glad to find that the Government proposed to spend some of this loan money in the Northern parts of the colony, including the Kimberley district. He hoped that when the contracts for the two goldfields railways were issued, provision would be made for the early completion of the work, as both of these lines were of pressing importance, and any delay in carrying them out would be a disastrous thing for the country. With regard to the Coolgardie line, he hoped that a clause would be inserted in the contract, allowing the contractor, in the event of Providence sending any rains to fill the tanks on the road, to use these tanks, after the railway passed beyond them, as they would not then be of much use to the travelling public. It would make a tremendous saving in the price of the work if the contractor were allowed to do this.

MR. R. F. SHOLL thought it was premature to make any provision on this year's Estimates for the Bridgetown and the Collie railways. They had received

a very clear intimation from the Upper House that they would oppose these two lines, when the special Bills authorising their construction were brought forward next session. It was also doubtful whether they would receive the support of the majority in the Legislative Assembly, especially the Collie line. Therefore it seemed to him premature to make provision, as was done on these Estimates, for the expenditure of over £20,000 on these works during the coming year. He thought the Government should wait until they got the special Bills passed before they incurred this expenditure. With regard to the item for the development of goldfields, he hoped the Government would not spend any of this money merely for the sake of spending it. He knew there was a desire on the part of some of these goldfields, and particularly Coolgardie, to see the Government providing them with everything they wanted. They were not satisfied unless they got about half the revenue of the colony.

MR. MORAN: They supply half the revenue.

MR. R. F. SHOLL did not think so; nor anything like it. He hoped the Government would not spend this money except upon works that were absolutely necessary, and not spend it simply for the sake of benefiting particular localities. With regard to the Geraldton jetty, he hoped the Government would not make the same blunder with this work as they did before, and that they would get someone to make proper soundings, before they extended this jetty again. As to the vote for dredging purposes, he hoped the Government would not keep the dredge much longer at Albany, but give other ports an opportunity of utilising it—if they could get the vessel away from Albany, which he believed was doubtful, in its present condition.

MR. RICHARDSON said he noticed, in connection with the railway from Donnybrook to Bridgetown, that the Government, during the coming year, proposed to have the survey of this line completed. He would like to impress upon them whether it would not be a good thing and a wise thing to appoint a commission of inspection to examine the country and decide upon the best route to adopt for this railway, before

bringing in the Bill for its construction. He thought this would obviate a repetition of the battle of the routes that had occurred in connection with other lines, consequent upon conflicting interests. It appeared to him they would only be able to arrive at a proper conclusion as to the best route by the appointment of an independent committee, consisting of thoroughly practical men—say two members of the Upper House and three or four members of the Lower House—to make a practical inspection of the various routes suggested, without reference so much to engineering or even political grounds, but simply from the point of view of which would be the best route in the interests of the country. There was a strong divergence of opinion amongst the residents of the district as to the best route to be adopted, and it appeared to him it would be difficult to arrive at any satisfactory conclusion unless such a committee as he had referred to were appointed. He strongly urged this matter upon the attention of the Government. With regard to harbour improvements, he should like to refer to the proposed improvements at Carnarvon. As one of the select committee on the question of meat supply, he wished to impress upon the Government the importance of making Carnarvon a really good shipping place for live stock. From the evidence and the information before them, the committee came to the conclusion that it would be greatly in the interests of a regular supply of cheap meat for the metropolitan markets if such shipping facilities could be provided at Carnarvon as would enable live stock to be shipped there in the steamers calling there, without the delay, the expense, and inconvenience attending the shipping of stock at present. The conclusion the committee arrived at was that no practical good could be effected by sticking to the present jetty. The estimated cost of improving the channel and bridging the river so that steamers could approach it was enormous, and the conclusion forced upon the committee was that it would be better to make a new jetty from Babbage Island. He could not help thinking that the cost of this work would not be so enormous as had been stated. The committee thought it might be done for considerably less than the sum men-

tioned; but even if it did cost £20,000, or even £25,000, the expenditure in his opinion would be justified. The reduction it would make in the freight upon live stock, and the saving it would effect in the price of meat for the consuming community at Perth and on the gold-fields, would in a very few years recoup the expenditure. He noticed from these Estimates that the Government proposed to expend £540,000 out of loan money during the next 12 months. He hoped that in the expenditure of this new loan the Government would spread the expenditure over the next three or four years at least, and not have all these works carried on simultaneously, and then have a sudden reaction and come to a dead stop, which could only have one result—to thoroughly disorganise the labour market. He thought a serious responsibility rested upon the Government in this respect. It would be a disastrous thing to create an artificial boom in the labour market in a small community like this, and then have the inevitable reaction with its attendant distress and labour troubles. Therefore, he hoped the Government would not be in too desperate a hurry to expend this loan money, but would confine the expenditure within reasonable bounds, and proceed only with such works as were of most urgent necessity, and likely to prove beneficial to the country.

MR. ILLINGWORTH did not intend to go over all the pages of these Estimates; he merely desired to call the attention of the committee to an item already referred to, and he did so with the view of emphasising what he had said on previous occasions with regard to the propriety of undertaking some of these works out of current revenue instead of out of loan. He referred particularly to the item, "Additional improvements to opened railways." He had on several occasions commented upon and illustrated how the profits on our railways were made, and pointed out that a good deal of the work that properly belonged to the maintenance of the railways, and which should by right be defrayed out of revenue, was paid for out of loan money. On page 33 they had a fair sample of this kind of thing. They had there enumerated the various works which it was proposed to carry out dur-

ing the coming year, out of loan funds. It was a long list, but it was really worth quoting, as illustrating the principle which he had already condemned. Here it was: "Completion or partial completion of the following works:—Additional latrines at Fremantle Station; duplicating telephone line Perth to Fremantle; water supply at Midland Junction; new goods shed, Fremantle; additional siding at Midland Junction; chaff shed at Fremantle Station; erecting two cranes at York; safety stop blocks to sidings; purchase and erection of six 5-ton cranes; improvements to Northam Station; booking office for West Perth Station; additional siding at Fremantle Station yard; brackets to strengthen rails at sharp curves on Eastern and Northern Railways; buildings at North Fremantle Station; additions to office at Cottesloe; shelter shed and approach road at Subiaco; office and waiting room at West Perth; platform and buildings at East Perth; new station at Midland Junction; extra sidings at Smith's Mill; sidings and turntable at Chidlow's Wells; altering sidings at Clackline; sidings and refreshment room at Spencer's Brook; water supply at York; new station at Newcastle; additional sidings at Jarrahdale Junction; relaying eight miles of the line Bunbury to Boyanup with heavier rails; electric staff and telephones; cottages for permanent way employés; and improvements and additions to water supply, signalling, telephones, roads in station yards, &c., &c." These were the works the cost of which was to be defrayed out of money which it was proposed to borrow in the London market. Take the first item: additional latrines at Fremantle Station. This station, he believed, was about the first station ever built in the colony; it had been in existence he did not know how many years; and yet, because it required a few washstands, they must be paid for out of borrowed money.

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (HON. H. W. VENN): Because they were never provided before.

MR. ILLINGWORTH: That did not alter the fact. Surely a railway that had been in existence all these years, and which they were told yielded a handsome profit, should be able to supply these

small wants; and in this year of grace we should not be called upon to go into the London market to borrow money to provide one of our principal stations with a few additional latrines. It was easy to make profits out of our railways, if we provided for such expenditure as this in our Loan Bills. A railway that had been in existence for a great many years, if it did not pay its working and maintenance expenses there must be something seriously wrong about it. It was no use our trying to live in a fool's paradise, and have Estimates presented to the House, and returns showing that our railways were paying six or seven per cent. on their cost, when we had to borrow money to provide the oldest railway station in the colony with a few washstands. The same remark applied to nearly the whole of these items. It was not the items that he objected to, but the principle; and he trusted that this would be the last occasion on which such items would be submitted to the House in any Loan Estimates. Fancy going into the London market to borrow money for additional latrines at one of our principal railway stations! Fancy going into the London market to borrow money for erecting two cranes at York, or a booking office at West Perth station! Fancy going into the London market to borrow money to make additions to an office at a roadside station at Cottesloe! Fancy going into the London market to borrow money for a refreshment room at Spencer's Brook! Fancy going to the London market, in this year of grace, to borrow money for building a chaff-shed at the principal port of the colony! It really approached the ridiculous. He must seriously enter his protest against it for what it was worth. Whether members agreed with him was another matter. But the day would come when the House would see, and the country would see, and would want an explanation when figures were brought before Parliament to show that our railways were paying 6 or 7 per cent. on their cost, while at the same time we had included in our Loan Estimates such items as these.

MR. CLARKSON had heard it said that fools learned by their own experience, but that the wise man profited by the experience of others. He thought that was very true. Allusion had been made

by the hon. member for the De Grey to the proposed route of the railway from Donnybrook to Bridgetown, and to the mistakes that had been made in the past in selecting some of our other railway routes. He hoped we would profit by our past experience in this respect. The route adopted for our Eastern Railway was a standing example of hasty construction. The route adopted was one that had been regretted ever since. We were now spending many thousands of pounds in attempting to improve it; but he was afraid this large expenditure would improve the line but very little indeed. He had the authority of those who were running the trains for saying that beyond Chidlow's Well it was not likely to improve the line at all. Therefore he hoped that, in the future, the Government would be a little more careful in selecting the routes for our railways. As to this Bridgetown line he hoped it would be a long time before it would be necessary to settle the route, because he thought the line was not required at present.

MR. COOKWORTHY said of course he did not agree with the last speaker, that the Bridgetown railway should not be constructed, for he thoroughly believed that, when it was constructed, it would not only be of great use to the settlers of the district and to the colony generally, but also that in a few years it would be no great loss to the revenue of the colony. Still he hoped the Government would be careful in the selection of the best route. There were two principal routes—one by the tinfields and the other by the Preston valley. No doubt there were at present a considerable number of settlers on the Preston valley route—far more than on the tinfields route. He did not mean to say there were no settlers on the tinfields route, or that the line taken that way would not assist in the development of those fields. But they did not know whether these tinfields did not extend towards the Preston, and, if so, the Preston valley route would be as advantageous to the tinfields as the other, while at the same time it would serve a larger number of settlers. He hoped this question of route would receive very careful consideration. With regard to what the hon. member for Nannine had said about borrowing money for

railway improvements, he must remind the hon. member that all these works were new works, and works which would have been provided for out of loan if they had been constructed when the lines were built in the first instance. If the hon. member were a shareholder in any English line, and the directors were to defray the cost of all new sidings and other works necessary out of the revenue derived from the railway itself, he was afraid the hon. member would get very little in the way of dividend. In every private undertaking the construction account and the revenue account must be left separate, and he thought every item on this list was fairly chargeable to construction account—as much so as if they had been provided when the line was first built.

MR. LEFROY quite agreed with what the hon. member for the De Grey had said, that it would be well if the expenditure of this loan money were spread over as long a period as possible. Of course there were one or two works, such as the goldfields railways, which it was urgent should be carried through as quickly as possible, and a very considerable portion of this loan would be applied to the construction and equipment of those lines, and the Government would not be carrying out the wishes of the colony if they were to allow these works to be extended over a period of three or four years. In fact, the sooner they were completed the better. But some of the other works were not of such urgent necessity, and there was no reason why they should be pressed forward with undue haste. With regard to the item of improvements to existing lines, he was glad to see that the Government proposed to make some improvements at the Midland Junction, which he thought was one of the worst provided stations in the colony. These improvements were of pressing necessity, seeing that the Midland Railway would probably be opened for traffic in a few months, and he hoped the Government would lose no time in improving the present accommodation, even if they had to do it out of revenue, and repay it afterwards out of loan.

MR. RANDELL thought the Government were to be complimented on the very clear manner in which these Loan Estimates had been placed before the

House, as they embodied a great deal of information, which could be gathered at a glance. Some of the earlier loans, he noticed, had been reduced pretty low, and the money available for some of the items was very small,—in one instance, there was only 3s. 4d. left. He thought it was very satisfactory to have a clear outline of the intentions of the Government, with regard to the proposed new undertakings, and of the policy which it was proposed to adopt in regard to them. He gathered from the Premier's remarks, that it was proposed to make a new departure in one or two respects, one of them being the purchase by the Government of the sleepers that would be required by the contractors for railway construction. He was inclined to think with the hon. member for West Kimberley, that it would be better to leave the contractors to make their own arrangements. He was not aware of any great difficulty having been experienced in procuring sleepers. Possibly, if the Government purchased a large number of sleepers in advance, they might find a considerable quantity of them left on their hands. There was another point: probably the contractor would not be so careful over them if they were supplied by the Government as if he had to supply them himself. He thought this was a matter that should be very carefully considered, before the Government made this new departure in railway construction. He was doubtful himself as to the success of the experiment. He was sorry to hear there was a likelihood of the battle of the routes being revived over another railway. They had had these battles over other railways, and he was afraid the outcome had not always been satisfactory. It was really surprising how conflicting interests warped the judgment of people in different localities. He had heard that the line through the Greenough Flats was not at all in the right place, and it was now admitted that the route adopted for the Eastern Railway, beyond Spencer's Brook, had been regretted ever since. But he thought the hon. member for Newcastle must have been misinformed that the deviations made no improvement. Looking at the great reduction made in the gradients, it was incredible that there should not be some improvement. He could not conceive that a man like the

Engineer-in-Chief would have sanctioned and recommended this large expenditure unless the results were likely to be such as were represented by him in his reports. He did not know that the plan suggested by the hon. member for the De Grey, for settling the route of the Bridgetown line, —to have a committee appointed—would be a good one. He thought the matter might be left to the Government. That part of the country had been settled for the last fifty years, and it would be strange if by this time there should be any difficulty in deciding upon the best route. He thought this was a responsibility that should be accepted by the Government, assisted by their own officers. He desired to express his concurrence with what the hon. member for the De Grey had said about the wisdom of not being in too great haste in prosecuting some of these loan works. They all recognised the desirability and necessity of constructing the goldfields lines as soon as possible, so long as it did not entail too much additional expense. But, with regard to most of the other works, he did not think there was any urgent necessity for pushing them forward with any great hurry. He was afraid that when all these works were completed, the labour market would be overstocked, and that we might find ourselves face to face with the unemployed difficulty. He thought a moderate rate of progress was the best and safest course to adopt in regard to these public works. We were not a large community, and it would be very easy for us to land ourselves in trouble if we pressed on with these public works unduly, and then came to a standstill. He was very much in accord with the hon. member for Nannine that some of the items on these Loan Estimates might well have been undertaken out of revenue,—some of the small items which the hon. member had indicated. He really did think it would be much better to provide for such items out of the general revenue. It would have this effect—we would not be as likely to enter upon them unless they were absolutely necessary, and, to that extent, it would be an economy, while, so long as we were able to go into the loan market, there was a tendency to undue expenditure, which would otherwise be avoided. With reference to railway sidings and

the more important works indicated, there could be no question, he thought, that they would have to be provided out of loan money, but there were a number of smaller items which he thought should not form a portion of any loan. He again desired to express his thanks for the very explicit way in which the proposed loan expenditure had been placed before them in the Estimates. He trusted that the result of this large expenditure would be the development of the country, and increased prosperity to all its people.

MR. MORAN suggested the necessity for constructing a small branch line to remedy the inconvenience of the site of the present station at Southern Cross. With regard to the Coolgardie line, the sooner that work was taken in hand and pushed through the better would it be for all concerned, and the less would be the difficulty likely to be experienced from an overcrowded labour market, as the construction of this railway would give such a fillip to the mining industry that a large field of labour would be found on our goldfields. The all-important question with regard to this great work was the water question, for there could be no doubt that if we got no rain, the contract price for this railway would have to be raised, he might say, hundreds of thousands of pounds.

[AN HON. MEMBER: Nonsense.] No nonsense at all. They had to cart two tons of water for every ton of stuff from Northam to Southern Cross, which meant £2 for every ton of stuff and £4 for water. That would soon bring up the cost of this railway by the time they carried it through to Coolgardie, especially if the water supply at Northam were to give out, and water had to be hauled from this end of the line as the contractor's basis of supply. Therefore he hoped that no efforts would be spared by the Government in providing water in this direction, which, in his opinion, was even more urgent than the railway itself. He did not think the water supply at Northam would last through the summer. Should it be found impossible to obtain water along this line by means of bores, it would be cheaper for the Government to establish large condensing works on the line, not only for the convenience of the contractor, but also for the travelling

public. They would find that the difference it would make in the price of the contract would more than counterbalance the expenditure incurred.

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn) said he could not agree with the suggestion of the hon. member for the De Grey that they should appoint a committee of members of the two Houses to decide upon the route to be followed by our railways. If the Government, with the assistance of their own engineers, were unable to determine the best route, he did not know who would be. Whatever mistakes in this respect had been made in the past, the present Government at any rate had made no mistake, for all the members of the present Ministry had, at any rate, a thorough knowledge of the country—probably more so than anybody else; and the House might be quite satisfied that the present Engineer-in-Chief was not the man to recommend a route unless he was satisfied that it was the best available route, both as regards gradients and for the working of the line in every other way. With regard to the remarks of the hon. member for Nannine, who talked a great deal about washstands—though there was nothing in these Estimates about washstands—he might say that the conveniences and improvements referred to had never yet been provided at Fremantle, and were absolutely necessary. If they had been provided when the line was built, no one would have dreamt of suggesting that they should be provided out of revenue, instead of out of loan, like other portions of the line. The same remark applied to the other items under the head of improvements to lines already opened. With regard to what the hon. member for the Moore had said about the lack of facilities at the Midland Junction, the reason why these improvements had not been undertaken before now was owing to the unsettled state of the Midland Railway question. At one time, as members were aware, there was a possibility of that line becoming a Government line, and it would have been rather unwise for the Government to have built and equipped a station within a quarter of a mile of the company's station, when one station would have answered the purpose. The matter now had arrived at that stage that the Government and the company had come

to a friendly arrangement, by which the Government might put up a station at the Junction that would serve the purposes of the Government and the company for all time. With regard to the question of providing sleepers for contractors, that was a question which had not been definitely settled yet, and, he thought, before it was done, the matter would have to be further discussed. The Engineer-in-Chief was inclined to think it would be a good thing; but it had not been decided upon yet. If the Government did provide them, it would be done in the ordinary way, by calling for tenders. The hon. member for Yilgarn, for a wonder, had touched upon the water difficulty, and no doubt that was a factor which could not be ignored in connection with the railway to Coolgardie. He thought everybody were agreed that the Government should hurry on with the construction of these two goldfields lines. There was no serious water difficulty in connection with the Murchison line, but it was a very important question indeed in connection with the Coolgardie line. At present there was no available water which the contractor could rely upon beyond the Burlong pool at Northam until he got to Coolgardie; therefore members would see at once the gravity of the situation. If the contract were hurried, the contractor would have to make some provision for obtaining his water, which undoubtedly would run to a lot of money; and it was a question whether the Government should not hold their hands a while, until there was rain to fill the tanks on this line. The hon. member suggested that they should sink or bore for water; but, so far, they had not discovered any fresh water that could be used for working locomotives, without fouling the engines in a very few days. So that he was rather afraid, unless we had rain before we let this contract, that the tenders would be very high indeed; in fact, he did not know how they were going to get along at all. The hon. member also spoke about an extension or siding at Southern Cross. The Premier, when he was up there, promised the Yilgarn people they should have an extension of the present line, to enable them to get their firewood cheaper; and, the Government having promised it, the work would be done without delay. As

to what had been said by the hon. member for Toodyay about the deviations on the Eastern Railway being no improvement, the hon. member had been entirely misinformed. It was impossible to get away from the fact that the gradients had been improved in a marked degree, and that the result fully justified the expenditure.

MR. CONNOR wished to take this opportunity of drawing the attention of members to the fact that, earlier in the session, he had brought forward a motion, which was scouted at the time, pointing out the necessity which existed for boring for water in this colony if we want to make the country a success. Although what he said on that occasion was scouted, it was coming back to them now, and the Government were beginning to realise the force of the motion he then put forward and the necessity for the diamond drill, if they wanted to get over this water difficulty. The Commissioner had given them a very gloomy picture of the prospects of the Coolgardie line, owing to this same difficulty. His own opinion was that before building further railways and before spending any more money on Fremantle harbour works, or any other works, the necessity positively and absolutely existed for taking some steps for procuring water without further delay, either by boring or by some other means.

THE DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS (Hon. H. W. Venn) said of course if the House was of that opinion, it would be necessary for the Government to come down with a further Loan Bill for £150,000 or £200,000. They certainly had not got the money at the present moment, nor was it provided for in the Loan Bill of this session. If the House was of opinion that water must be found at any cost, the House must certainly provide the Government with a larger sum than they were at present provided with.

MR. MORAN said if there was a necessity for providing another £100,000 for this purpose, he thought the House would not be averse to it, as it would undoubtedly be the means of making these loan works more productive. He thought no money could be spent to greater advantage in this colony than in tapping Nature's resources in the interior to provide water. Set Nature's works

going first, and talk about improving your towns and harbours afterwards. He thought it would be a wise and statesmanlike course to curtail the proposed expenditure on the Fremantle harbour works, and devote the money for this purpose.

MR. CONNOR: Or do away with the Bridgetown railway.

MR. MORAN: Yes, if necessary. He was perfectly satisfied himself that in the plains and basins between Northam and Coolgardie there were millions and millions of gallons of water stored, sufficient for all requirements. If it was too brackish for engine purposes it could be condensed. They could not rely upon the clouds, and, if the only alternative open to them cost another £100,000, he thought the expenditure would be perfectly justified, seeing that, if successful, it would double the fruitfulness of the million-and-a-half expenditure contemplated under the present loan. He believed the saving in the price of the Coolgardie railway alone would compensate the Government for expending another £100,000 in providing water.

MR. CLARKSON firmly believed that if the Government came to the House with a supplementary loan for £50,000 to provide water in the country Eastward, it would be carried by a large majority. They were all agreed that this water question was the most serious and the most important question that was engaging public attention at the present moment; and before they talked about building railways to this part of the country, they ought to have tested it for an artesian water supply.

MR. ILLINGWORTH also hoped the Government would give more attention to boring for water, even if it did cost £100,000. If they could borrow money for putting up washstands at railway stations, surely they could borrow for this all-important matter of finding water for our goldfields. These goldfields, he wanted to emphasise, were a source of profit to the community. The Government received nearly £26,000 a year from miners' rights and leases alone, and he was afraid they were not giving that attention to this question of boring for water which its importance deserved; and, until that House forced the hands of the Government by constantly din-

ning at them, he was afraid they would not get them to do what was wanted. They were told by scientists and geologists that there was no possibility of obtaining artesian water on our Eastern goldfields. He remembered that geologists told them they would not find gold at Bendigo below 200ft., whereas it was now obtained at 2,300ft. So much for the value of scientific opinion.

MR. LEAKE could not allow this discussion to close without entering his protest against what he considered a dangerous element in these Loan Estimates, as already pointed out by the hon. member for Nannine. If they recognised the right of the Government to come down and ask for £60,000 for such works as were enumerated here under the head of improvements to opened railways, they would find, as our railway system expanded, the Government coming down with Loan Bills for these items. Unless strenuous efforts were made to apportion a sum out of revenue for such items, they would be landed before long in very serious difficulties. In passing these Loan Estimates with items such as these, they were affirming what he submitted was a very dangerous principle. It was the thin end of the wedge to serious abuses. It enabled the Commissioner of Railways for the time being to present to Parliament railway returns which showed how nicely, apparently, our railways were paying. But paying at whose expense? At the expense of other departments, and practically getting their profit out of capital. That was what it amounted to. As to boring for water, although they were led to believe that some of this loan money would be allotted for boring purposes, he did not find any allocation for that purpose. Before they undertook the construction of a railway through a waterless country like Coolgardie, surely one of the first things that should have occurred to the mighty minds of any Administration was that we should first find water. That should have been the initial expense. It appeared now that the Government could do nothing in the matter unless we gave them another loan of £150,000. So they were told by the Commissioner. He (Mr. Leake) had said so all along--this loan policy of the present Government was only just commencing. Next session they might have an-

other loan for £250,000. He did not want to prophesy, but let them bear in mind what he had just told them.

MR. CLARKSON asked if the Government was aware that the water on the Yilgarn line was rapidly giving out, and that the water used in the locomotives was destroying them?

MR. R. F. SHOLL was of opinion that the Government should have discovered a supply of water along the route before they attempted to construct the Coolgardie line. The line would be comparatively useless unless there was water along it. But Coolgardie was not the only part of the colony where water was required, though anyone would think so, from what the member for the district told them. With him Coolgardie was everything. It was his alpha and his omega. It was the salvation of the colony. Without Coolgardie he did not know where the colony would be. [MR. MORAN: Up the spout!] He had been informed by a very shrewd man that Coolgardie would be found to be the greatest bubble that West Australia had ever seen.

THE COMMISSIONER OF CROWN LANDS (Hon. W. E. Marnion): Do you believe it?

MR. R. F. SHOLL was not in a position to say one way or the other. [MR. MORAN: Dry up! oh, dry up!] The hon. member was very eager to grasp all the money he could for his own district. He was so greedy that he verily believed he would take sugar out of a bird cage.

SIR J. G. LEE STEERE said he should like to say a few words with regard to the item of harbour works at Fremantle. He had taken the opportunity of reading the correspondence on the subject between the Premier and the Engineer-in-Chief, laid on the table last night, and, in his opinion, the reply of the Engineer-in-Chief to the questions put to him by the Premier was very unsatisfactory, because he did not answer the question whether the ocean mail steamers could come inside this harbour at all times and in all weathers. His answer was that they could lie within the harbour in all weathers, after they got in—a very different matter indeed. The Engineer-in-Chief did not say that they would be able to come in, in all weathers, and, if he did say so, he (Sir James) did

not think he was a competent authority on the subject. He was a very competent engineer, but the only man who could give an answer to the question he referred to was a man who was acquainted with seamanship. A gentleman whom they knew very well, and who was connected with some of the large steamers calling here, volunteered the statement to him that very day that if he came here with his vessel when this harbour was made he would not think, except it was very fine weather, of taking his steamer into that harbour. This was not a large mail steamer, but a much smaller steamer. There was another statement made in the Engineer-in-Chief's letter; it only showed the obstacles that were placed in the way of carrying out the only kind of harbour that would be likely to induce the ocean mail steamers to enter it. They had been told that the cost of the present breakwater was £16 per foot, and that if they got into deeper water it would be £20 per foot; but now the Engineer-in-Chief said that if this breakwater were extended, with an arm to the southward, it could not be done under £500,000 extra. Now, considering that there would only be about 5,000ft. extra to complete it, as suggested, he could not understand how the Engineer-in-Chief made it come to £500,000. At £20 a foot it would only be £100,000. It really appeared to him that the Engineer-in-Chief had named this enormous sum so that members would not think of undertaking the work. He hoped the Government would pursue their inquiries further, and not be guided entirely in this matter by the Engineer-in-Chief, because he believed the Engineer-in-Chief was not a competent authority upon such a question. He believed Mr. O'Connor was a thoroughly good engineer, but he had no experience to enable him to say whether large steamers would come in through that passage at all times and in all weathers. He (Sir James) had no hesitation in saying that they would not. What he would suggest to the Government was that the plans of the harbour, as proposed by the Engineer-in-Chief, should be sent home, to the principal Steamship Companies in England, and that they should get reports from the masters of their steamers, as to whether, when this harbour is completed according

to those plans, they would undertake to take their steamers inside it at all times and in all weathers. This, he thought, would be the most practical and satisfactory way of settling the question,—to get the opinions of these practical seamen. These were the men whose opinions we wanted to get on a question of this kind, and not the opinion of the Engineer-in-Chief, who, though an excellent engineer, and a man for whom he had the greatest respect, was not competent to express an opinion upon a question of seamanship.

MR. R. F. SHOLL hoped the Government would not press for a vote under the head of "Salaries" at that late hour. He moved, as an amendment, that the amount of the vote be reduced by £10,000. He was satisfied that if the amount were reduced, the work would be done all the same, and just as expeditiously.

Amendment put, and division taken, with the following result:—

Ayes	5
Noes	13

Majority against ... 8

AYES.	NOES.
Mr. Harper	Mr. Burt
Mr. Illingworth	Mr. Clarkson
Mr. R. F. Sholl	Mr. Cookworthy
Sir J. G. Loe Steere	Sir John Forrest
Mr. Leake (Teller).	Mr. A. Forrest
	Mr. Lefroy
	Mr. Marmion
	Mr. Monger
	Mr. Moran
	Mr. Randell
	Mr. Venn
	Mr. Wood
	Mr. Paterson (Teller).

Amendment thus negatived.

Vote put and passed.

Loan, 1884, £1,697 6s. 2d. (exclusive of salaries):

Put and passed.

Loan, 1888, £1,259 2s. 4d. (exclusive of salaries):

Put and passed.

Loan, 1891, £217,177 0s. 9d. (exclusive of salaries):

MR. R. F. SHOLL asked whether the Mullewa railway had been taken over by the Government.

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn) said the railway would be taken over in a few days.

Vote put and passed.

Loan, 1893, £208,570 15s. 10d. (exclusive of salaries):

MR. R. F. SHOLL asked whether it was not a fact that the Yilgarn railway had been completed and taken over.

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn) said the contractor had not yet handed over the line.

MR. R. F. SHOLL said he understood that a bonus had been offered for the completion of the railway by the 1st of June instead of December next; but although the contractor had received the bonus, he had not yet completed the railway.

MR. JAMES said the conditions of the bonus had not been complied with, as the line was not completed on the earlier date specified. An accident happened on the line, the other day, which would not have happened if the work had been completed. He asked who would pay for the damage done on that occasion? Was it a fact, also, that although the Government had had ample notice of the contractor's intention to hand over the railway on the 1st of June, yet the Government paid £3,800 to the contractor to run the line for a week or two? If so, why did not the Government take over the line on the 1st of June, and work it by their own servants?

MR. R. F. SHOLL said hon. members were expected to understand these Estimates, yet the Government did not understand them.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) said the hon. member would find, on page 22 of the Estimates, a statement showing the probable state of the loan undertakings at the end of the current financial year, and showing also the progress in the works anticipated to be made during the year.

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn), referring to the Mullewa railway contract, and quoting portions of it, said the Government considered that the contract had been duly executed according to its spirit, if not according to the very letter. With regard to the contractor having been asked to work the railway for a short time, the explanation was that the Government did not receive notice, as stated; and as the contractor had all the water tanks at the time, the Govern-

ment agreed to pay him a sum of money to run the line for a short time, because, if the Government had hired the contractor's tanks, they must have stopped his work. At that period of the year there was a general expectation that rain would fall, and if it had fallen there would not have been the scarcity which was felt even yet. The moment the tanks were ready for use, the Government took over the railway.

MR. ILLINGWORTH said that after paying the contractor to hand over the railway on the 1st of June, the Government paid him a further sum of money to work the railway for a time.

MR. JAMES said surely the Government must have had ample notice that the line would be ready on the 1st of June; or, if the contractor did not give ample notice, the Government should have taken that fact into consideration when paying the bonus.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) said the Government had expected rain to fall at the time.

MR. R. F. SHOLL said he really thought the Government had been trading on their usual luck. They had thought an all-wise and bountiful Providence would again favour them. Providence had seen them through so far, and they were trusting too much on Providence. If the Government had used their own judgment, he did not think the bonus would have been necessary. It did appear to him unprecedented that a bonus of £2,500 should be paid to the contractor to complete the railway six months earlier than the original date, and that afterwards the Government paid him £3,700 to work the railway for a period. It was the roughest railway he had ever travelled over—that was before it was ballasted.

MR. LEAKE asked whether the £2,500 was the only bonus paid.

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn): Yes.

MR. RANDELL asked whether the item "Railway Workshops, £10,440," included any sum for increasing the workshops at Fremantle.

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn) said that, wherever the future workshops might be located, some additions of working plant would be necessary; and he hoped the Government would decide on removing

the workshops from Fremantle. If they were not removed, the appliances must be increased for dealing with the work that had to be done.

MR. R. F. SHOLL said the Government should look the future boldly in the face, instead of tinkering with the question of removing the workshops from their present site. Having now obtained good artesian water by boring at the Midland Junction, the sooner the Government decided to erect workshops on the land recently acquired at the Junction, the better it would be for the future working of the railway system. The expert from Victoria, and others, had shown that the removal of the workshops from Fremantle should be undertaken; and the Government would not be doing their duty to the whole country if, for the sake of placating the constituencies of Fremantle, they did not make up their minds to take this necessary course. There should be no further shilly-shallying.

Vote put and passed.

Loan, 1894, 514,250 (exclusive of salaries):

MR. R. F. SHOLL asked whether the Government intended to invite tenders for constructing the railways to Coolgardie and Cue before the surveys were made. Had the Government decided on the route in each case?

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) said the special Bills for authorising these railways would be introduced, in a day or two. The Government had decided on the route.

MR. R. F. SHOLL asked whether the route of the Murchison railway would skirt round the goldfields, because there was also a large pastoral district at the Murchison, and the railway ought to take a course which would serve both the mining and pastoral industries.

MR. ILLINGWORTH said the Government should endeavour to secure the whole amount of the present loan as quickly as possible, if the financial advisers of the Government in London so advised. By doing so the Government could probably float the loan at 106, and that would realise a very large surplus. Hon. members would know that the London money market was a delicate thing, and might change suddenly; but at present there was every prospect of the

Government being able, perhaps up to the middle of 1895, to float this loan at a very high premium, this colony's bonds being quoted now at 110 to 111; therefore he thought the Government would be able to realise for the new loan 104 to 106. Such a surplus would pay the interest on the loan for twelve to fifteen months ahead. He hoped the Government would never act contrarily to the advice of their financial advisers in London; but, if advised to raise the whole amount at once, he felt certain there would be no more opportune time than during the next few months.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) said the matter had not escaped the attention of the Government, and they intended to communicate almost immediately with London in regard to the matter. The Government could not at present say whether the bonds would be offered at 4 per cent. or $3\frac{1}{2}$.

MR. A. FORREST asked whether it was a fact that the banks in London which held money for the Government were not paying any interest on the balance of the last loan then in hand. If the new loan were raised within twelve or eighteen months there would be no interest on it to receive from the banks.

MR. R. F. SHOLL said that, if such was the case, it would be better for the Government to raise the new loan at $3\frac{1}{2}$ per cent., so that there might not be so much interest to pay to the lenders, rather than raise it at 4 per cent.

THE CHAIRMAN said the committee were getting somewhat mixed, because the loan items of expenditure were the question before the committee.

MR. R. F. SHOLL said Item 3, "Railway from Donnybrook towards Bridgetown, £21,950, including £18,000 for permanent way," was for a work not yet authorised to be constructed, and probably this railway would be rejected in another place, as was indicated in the message recently sent down from the Legislative Council. It would be absurd for the committee now to pass £21,950 for expenditure on a work that would probably not be authorised by Parliament.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest): We can pass it here, at any rate.

MR. R. F. SHOLL repeated that it would be absurd to pass an amount for

expenditure on a work that would probably be thrown out by the other House.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest): The same remark applies to every other item in the Loan Bill.

MR. R. F. SHOLL said that was not so, because there had not been a Message from the Council on other works in the Bill. He must protest against the passing of Item 3 for a work that was not likely to be sanctioned by Parliament.

MR. LEAKE suggested that the consideration of Item 3 should be postponed until they saw the result of the Bridgetown Railway Bill in another place.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest): We do not anticipate defeat.

MR. LEAKE: Are you not going to bring down the Bridgetown Railway Bill?

THE COMMISSIONER OF RAILWAYS (Hon. H. W. Venn): No; not this session. The rails proposed in this item to be purchased in readiness for the work would be in stock if the Bridgetown railway were not constructed, and the rails could be used for some other railway.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) said the surveys must be made in anticipation of the railway being authorised. As the Commissioner had just explained, the Government would, probably, not be in a position to submit the Bridgetown Railway Bill to Parliament this session, because of the difficulty in regard to routes. That was a troublesome question to settle, as the Government wanted to be in a position to give some idea of the route; therefore they would, probably, not be able to submit the Bill this year. But that was no reason why they should not obtain the rails in readiness, and have them in stock. The Loan Bill had passed both Houses, and only awaited the Governor's assent. The course now proposed in reference to indenting for rails had been pursued before; it was the course taken last year in reference to the Yilgarn and Mullewa railways. The hon. member for the Gascoyne, who raised this objection, was weak-backed; he was afraid of a whisper from the other House. This Assembly should manage its business in its own way, and leave the other House to pursue its own course. There would be nothing irregular in ordering these rails, to have them in stock

ready. If the Government had had sufficient information for enabling them to determine the route earlier, he would not be afraid to bring in the Bridgetown Railway Bill this year, and, in that case, he believed the good sense of the other House would carry the Bill through.

MR. R. F. SHOLL, referring to item 5 (Rolling stock for above mentioned railways, and additional rolling stock for existing lines, £60,650), said the Minister in another place had stated that the whole amount of this item would be required for rolling stock for existing lines, whether the proposed new lines were constructed or not. He asked for an explanation of that.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) said he had also, in this House, given an explanation to the same effect, and could show it in black and white.

Vote put and passed.

The Loan Estimates being completed, the resolutions were reported.

Report adopted.

Ordered—That a Message be transmitted to the Legislative Council, submitting the Loan Estimates, 1894-95.

POLICE ACT AMENDMENT BILL.

REASONS FOR DISAGREEING TO AMENDMENTS.

The Order of the Day for the consideration of the committee's reasons for disagreeing to certain amendments made by the Legislative Council in this Bill having been read, MR. MONGER, on behalf of the committee, brought up the reasons, which were read, as follow:—

Reasons of the Legislative Assembly for disagreeing with Amendments Nos. 1 and 3 made by the Legislative Council in "The Police Act Amendment Bill."

As to No. 1.—While regretting the prevalence of smoking amongst lads, this House does not deem it desirable to make smoking by boys under fourteen years of age a penal offence, thus rendering them liable to imprisonment should the fine be not paid.

As to No. 3.—That open betting being an evil, which this Bill endeavours to prevent, it is desirable that the Bill should come into operation at once; and because the proposed new clause would give an undue preference to certain clubs.

MR. MONGER moved that the committee's reasons be adopted.

Question put and passed.

Ordered—That a Message be transmitted to the Legislative Council, informing them that the Assembly had agreed to Amendment No. 2 made by them in the "Police Act Amendment Bill," and had disagreed to Amendments Nos. 1 and 3, and forwarding the reasons for such disagreement.

PHARMACY AND POISONS BILL.

REPORT.

Report of committee considered.

Amendment made by the committee in Clause 6 agreed to.

Clause 12:

THE ATTORNEY GENERAL (Hon. S. Burt) moved that the following new sub-clauses be added to the clause:—

Meetings of the Council. Number of votes of members.

"(1.) At every meeting of the Council
"each member, including the
"president, shall have one vote,
"and the president shall, in case
"of an equality of votes, have a
"casting vote in addition to his
"ordinary vote, and all questions
"at any meeting of the Council
"shall be decided by a majority
"of the votes of the members
"present."

Proceedings of Board not invalidated by reason of vacancies.

"(3.) No action or proceedings of the
"Council shall be invalidated by
"reason of the existence of any
"vacancy or vacancies therein,
"provided that the number of
"members be not reduced below
"four."

Question put and passed.

Remaining amendments made by the committee agreed to.

Clause 43:

THE ATTORNEY GENERAL (Hon. S. Burt) moved that the following new sub-clause be added to the clause:

Meetings of the Council and conduct of business.

"(a.) Regulating the meetings and
"proceedings of the Council, and
"the conduct of their business."

Question put and passed.

Report, with further amendments, adopted.

Ordered—That the third reading of the Bill be made an Order of the Day for the next sitting of the House.

ESTIMATES, 1894-95.

Report of Committee of Supply, with the Additional Estimates, adopted.

COMMITTEE OF WAYS AND MEANS.

The House resolved itself into a Committee of Ways and Means.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) moved that, towards making good the supply to be granted to Her Majesty, a further sum not exceeding £526,600 18s. 4d. be granted out of the Consolidated Revenue Fund of Western Australia.

Motion put and passed.

Resolution reported.

Report adopted.

APPROPRIATION BILL.

Introduced by Sir JOHN FORREST, and read a first time.

ADJOURNMENT.

THE PREMIER (Hon. Sir J. Forrest) moved that the House, at its rising, do adjourn until Wednesday, 7th November, at half-past seven o'clock, p.m.

Motion put and passed.

The House adjourned at 11:40 o'clock p.m.

Legislative Assembly,

Wednesday, 7th November, 1894.

Trial water boring in Eastern districts—Southern Cross Coolgardie Railway Bill: first reading—Mullewa-Cue Railway Bill: first reading—Scab Act Amendment Bill: first reading—Purchase of Perth Waterworks Bill: first reading—Leave of absence for Mr. Simpson—Boring for water between Darling Range and the coast—Removal of Mr. Sinclair, Postmaster, Coolgardie—Selection by Lessees of Leasehold Lands under Homesteads Act—Adjournment.

THE SPEAKER took the chair at 7:30 p.m.

PRAYERS.

TRIAL WATER BORING IN EASTERN DISTRICTS.

MR. THROSSELL, in accordance with notice, asked the Director of Public Works whether, in view of the growing scarcity of water for locomotive and general purposes in Northam and other Eastern district towns, the Government would cause trial bores to be put down, without delay, in the localities referred to?

THE DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS (Hon. H. W. Venn) replied that the subject would be considered by the Government.

SOUTHERN CROSS-COOLGARDIE RAILWAY BILL.

Introduced by MR. VENN, and read a first time.

MULLEWA-CUE RAILWAY BILL.

Introduced by MR. VENN, and read a first time.

SCAB ACT AMENDMENT BILL.

Introduced by MR. BURT, and read a first time.

PURCHASE OF PERTH WATERWORKS BILL.

Introduced by MR. JAMES, and read a first time.

LEAVE OF ABSENCE.

On the motion of MR. JAMES, leave of absence was granted to MR. SIMPSON for one fortnight, upon the grounds of urgent private business.